# Consequential Boards Adding Value Where It Matters Most

Report of the National Commission on College and University Board Governance



# **Executive Summary**

he value of American higher education faces multiple risks, and changes in governance are needed to address them. At risk are accessibility and degree attainment for current and future students, institutional fiscal sustainability, educational quality, economic development and social equity, service to communities, and knowledge creation.

Leadership for change is more important than ever, and the choices ahead are more urgent and complex than those in the past. In this demanding environment, the structure of governance itself should not be an additional risk factor for the sector. Yet, too often it is. Board-president relationships

# Consequential Boards

Adding Value Where It Matters Most

are strained, the traditions of shared governance are fragile at best, and boards themselves too often fail to add value to institutional decision making. Governance processes are cumbersome and inwardly focused, roles and responsibilities among multiple actors are contested, and information for decision making is poor. Signs of pressure on governance are everywhere: polarized boards, rapid presidential turnover, faculty votes of noconfidence, and heightened scrutiny from accreditors, to name just a few. Dysfunctional governance contributes to the erosion of public trust in the ability of institutions to make choices that contribute to the public well-being.

Higher education cannot expect to return to the traditions that worked happily 50 years ago, when mostly honorific boards concentrated on selecting prominent leaders and on fundraising, and in which state and federal governments did not ask many questions about performance. In the future, higher education must be reconfigured to recognize new student populations, altered educational delivery methods, basic changes in financing, and rising expectations from the public. Boards must be at the forefront of those changes, because their fiduciary role requires them to focus on strategic long-term issues and the intersection of internal and public interests. Presidents and faculty will not be able to lead such changes on their own.

Boards are not the source of all of the governance challenges in higher education, but they can play a critical role in improving decision making within the sector. We offer seven recommendations aimed at boards in support of the distinct role only they can play in improving institutional value through more effective governance.

- 1. Boards must improve value in their institutions and lead a restoration of public trust in higher education itself.
- 2. Boards must add value to institutional leadership and decision making by focusing on their essential role as institutional fiduciaries.
- 3. Boards must act to ensure the long-term sustainability of their institutions by addressing changed finances and the imperative to deliver a high-quality education at a lower cost.
- 4. Boards must improve shared governance within their institutions through attention to boardpresident relationships and a reinvigoration of faculty shared governance. Boards additionally must attend to leadership development in their institutions, both for presidents and faculty.
- 5. Boards must improve their own capacity and functionality through increased attention to the qualifications and recruitment of members, board orientation, committee composition, and removal of members for cause.
- Boards must focus their time on issues of greatest consequence to the institution by reducing time spent reviewing routine reports and redirecting attention to cross-cutting and strategic issues not addressed elsewhere.
- 7. Boards must hold themselves accountable for their own performance by modeling the same behaviors and performance they expect from others in their institutions.

Leadership for change is more important than ever, and the choices ahead are more urgent and complex than those in the past. In this demanding environment, the structure of governance itself should not be an additional risk factor for the sector.

## Members of the National Commission on College and University Board Governance

## Honorable Philip Bredesen

Chair; Governor Tennessee (2003-2011)

#### Richard D. Legon

ex officio President Association of Governing Boards of Universities and Colleges

## Roberta Achtenberg

Board of Trustees California State University

## Gloria Aparicio Blackwell

Member, Board of Trustees Montgomery College (Maryland)

#### **Molly Corbett Broad**

President American Council on Education

#### Patrick Callan

President Higher Education Policy Institute

#### John Casteen, III

President Emeritus University of Virginia

#### Kent John Chabotar

Professor of Political Science and Retired President Guilford College

#### **Richard Chait**

**Professor Emeritus** Harvard Graduate School of Education

#### Mary Graham Davis

Chair, Board of Trustees Mount Holyoke College

#### José Fernández

Member, Board of Trustees University of Notre Dame

#### Honorable James E. Geringer Co-Founder and Chair, Board

of Trustees Western Governors University

## William E. (Brit) Kirwan

Chancellor University of Maryland System

**Albert Maury** Chair, Board of Trustees Florida International University

#### **Charles Miller**

Former Chair, Board of Regents University of Texas

#### **Scott Pattison**

**Executive Director** National Association of State **Budget Officers** 

#### **Martin Payson**

Trustee Emeritus Howard University and Tulane

## **Russell Ramsey**

Chairman Emeritus George Washington University

**John W. Rogers, Jr.** Board Member University of Chicago

**Gary Rhoades** Professor and Head Center for the Study of Higher Education University of Arizona

#### **Ann Daley Ryherd**

Former Executive Director Washington Higher Education Coordinating Board

#### Alex Shumate

Member and Chair, Governance Committee, Board of Trustees The Ohio State University

**Jeffrey Sonnenfeld** Senior Associate Dean, Yale School of Management, and Founder Chief Executive Leadership Institute

#### James Stern

Chairman Emeritus, Board of Trustees Tufts University

## William Trueheart

President and Chief Executive Officer Achieving the Dream

**Georgia Yuan**Former General Counsel and Secretary of the Corporation *Smith College* Former Deputy Undersecretary

The National Commission on College and University Board Governance was supported by the AGB Board of Directors and by grants from Lumina Foundation, the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, and the Kendall Foundation of the Montgomery County Community Foundation. The conclusions and observations in this report represent the views of the commission, and not those of sponsors.

